

Second Order Necessary Conditions in the Calculus of Variations

Consider the functional

$$J[x] = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} L(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) dt$$

defined on $\mathcal{D}[t_1, t_2]$ for L sufficiently differentiable.

Suppose $x(t_1) = x_1$ and $x(t_2) = x_2$ are fixed. Define the variation of J

$$J^\varepsilon[x] = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} L(t, x(t) + \varepsilon h(t), \dot{x}(t) + \varepsilon \dot{h}(t)) dt$$

under a variation of x to $x + \varepsilon h$ where

$$h(t_1) = h(t_2) = 0.$$

$$\left. \frac{dJ^\varepsilon}{d\varepsilon} \right|_{\varepsilon=0} = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \left(\frac{\partial L}{\partial x}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) h(t) + \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) \dot{h}(t) \right) dt$$

$$\text{and } \left. \frac{d^2 J^\varepsilon}{d\varepsilon^2} \right|_{\varepsilon=0} = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \left[\frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x^2}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) h^2(t) + 2 \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) h(t) \dot{h}(t) + \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial \dot{x} \partial \dot{x}}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) \dot{h}^2(t) \right] dt$$

We would like to refer to $\left. \frac{d^2 J^\varepsilon}{d\varepsilon^2} \right|_{\varepsilon=0}$

above as the second variation denoted by

$$\delta^2 J[h] = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \left[\frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial \dot{x}^2} \dot{h}^2 + 2 \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}} h \dot{h} + \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x^2} h^2 \right] dt$$

We can get rid of the $h \dot{h}$ term in the integral by integration by parts (we have assumed sufficient differentiability). Observe

$$\int_{t_1}^{t_2} 2 \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}} h \dot{h} dt$$

$$= \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}} \frac{d(h^2)}{dt} dt$$

$$= - \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}} \right) h^2 dt$$

$$+ \left. \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}} h^2 \right|_{t_1}^{t_2}$$

$$= - \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}} \right) h^2 dt.$$

Then $\delta^2 J[h] = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} [P(t) \dot{h}^2 + Q(t) h^2] dt$, where,

$$P(t) = \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial \dot{x}^2}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)); \quad Q(t) = \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x^2}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial x \partial \dot{x}} \right)$$

Theorem (second order necessary conditions).

Suppose $J[x]$ attains a local minimum at x ($\Rightarrow J^2[x]$ attains a local minimum at $\varepsilon=0$). Then:

$$(a) \quad \left. \frac{dJ^2}{d\varepsilon} \right|_{\varepsilon=0} = 0 \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad E-L \text{ holds}$$

$$(b) \quad \left. \frac{d^2 J^2}{d\varepsilon^2} \right|_{\varepsilon=0} \geq 0 \quad \Rightarrow \quad \text{~~there is~~}$$

(Legendre)

$$\frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial \dot{x} \partial \dot{x}}(t, x(t), \dot{x}(t)) \geq 0$$

at each t .

Proof (a) is already known

(b) That $\left. \frac{d^2 J^2}{d\varepsilon^2} \right|_{\varepsilon=0} \geq 0$ is a special case of Theorem on necessary conditions in lecture 11(a) page 1.

The Legendre condition follows from this.

To see this suppose not: say

$$P(t) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \frac{\partial^2 L}{\partial \dot{x} \partial \dot{x}}(t_0, x(t_0), \dot{x}(t_0)) = -2\beta, \quad \beta > 0$$

for some $t_0 \in [t_1, t_2]$.

By continuity of $P(t)$, there exists an $\alpha > 0$
 such that ~~$a < t_1$~~ $t_1 \leq t_0 - \alpha$, $t_0 + \alpha \leq t_2$, and
 $P(t) < -\beta$ $t_0 - \alpha \leq t \leq t_0 + \alpha$

Consider $\tilde{h}(t) \in \mathcal{D}(t_1, t_2)$ such that

$$\tilde{h}(t) = \begin{cases} \sin^2 \frac{\pi(t-t_0)}{\alpha} & t_0 - \alpha \leq t \leq t_0 + \alpha \\ 0 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{t_1}^{t_2} (P(t) \dot{\tilde{h}}(t)^2 + Q(t) \tilde{h}(t)^2) dt \\ &= \int_{t_0 - \alpha}^{t_0 + \alpha} P(t) \frac{\pi^2}{\alpha^2} \sin^2 \left(\frac{2\pi(t-t_0)}{\alpha} \right) dt \\ & \quad + \int_{t_0 - \alpha}^{t_0 + \alpha} Q(t) \sin^4 \frac{\pi(t-t_0)}{\alpha} dt \\ &< -\beta \frac{\pi^2}{\alpha^2} 2\alpha + 2M\alpha \end{aligned}$$

(where $M = \max_{[t_1, t_2]} |Q(t)|$)

For sufficiently small α the r.h.s. above
 becomes negative which is a contradiction.
 Thus $P(t) \geq 0$ $t \in [t_1, t_2]$ (Legendre)
 is necessary ▣

dependre unsuccessfully attempted to turn
 this into a sufficient conditions by the
 strengthened condition

$$P(t) > 0$$

(analogous to argument in lecture 11(a) page 2),
 and the following sophisticated completion of
 squares trick.

Observe, for an arbitrary differentiable

$w(t)$,

$$0 = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \frac{d}{dt} (w(t) \dot{h}^2(t)) dt$$

$$= \dot{w} \dot{h}^2(t) + 2w \dot{h}(t) \ddot{h}(t)$$

Adding this to $\delta^2 J[h]$ we get

$$\delta^2 J[h] = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} (P(t) \dot{h}^2(t) + Q(t) \dot{h}^2(t)) dt$$

$$= \int_{t_1}^{t_2} [P(t) \dot{h}^2(t) + 2w(t) \dot{h}(t) \ddot{h}(t) + (Q(t) + \dot{w}(t)) \dot{h}^2(t)] dt$$

$$= \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \left[P(t) \dot{h}(t) + (Q(t) + \dot{w}(t))^{1/2} h(t) \right]^2 dt$$

$$P(t) (Q(t) + \dot{w}(t)) = \dot{w}(t)^2$$

If w could be found then $\delta^2 J[R] > 0$
 $\neq h \neq 0$, and sufficiency applies.

The catch is that the Riccati equation

$$P(t) (Q(t) + \dot{w}(t)) = \dot{w}(t)^2$$

need not have a solution $w(t)$ ^{over} the entire interval $[t_1, t_2]$. Finite escape time for Riccati equations creates a problem. We need

Defn (Conjugate Points).

A point $\bar{a} \neq t_1$, $t_1 < \bar{a} \leq t_2$ is said to ~~be~~ be conjugate to t_1 if the

equation,

$$\frac{d}{dt} (P(t) \dot{h}(t)) = Q(t) h(t)$$

has a solution which vanishes $t = t_1$ and $t = \bar{a}$ but is not identically zero on $[t_1, \bar{a}]$ \square

Remark. The above differential equation is simply the Euler Lagrange equation for the quadratic functional

$$\int_{t_1}^{t_2} [P(t) \dot{h}^2(t) + Q(t) h^2(t)] dt.$$

Theorem

If $P(t) > 0$ on $[t_1, t_2]$ and if the interval $[t_1, t_2]$ contains no points conjugate to t_1 , then the

quadratic functional

$$\int_{t_1}^{t_2} [P(t) \dot{h}^2(t) + Q(t) h^2(t)] dt$$

is positive definite for all $h(t)$ s.t.

$$h(t_1) = h(t_2) = 0.$$

Proof Consider the equation

In the absence of conjugate points to t_1 (by hypothesis), this equation has a solution $u(t)$ which does not vanish anywhere on the interval $[t_1, t_2]$

$$\text{Let } w(t) = -\frac{\dot{u}(t) P(t)}{u(t)}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Then } \dot{w} &= \cancel{-\frac{\dot{u} \dot{P}}{u^2}} + \frac{1}{u^2} \dot{u} \dot{u} P(t) \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{u} \frac{d}{dt} (\dot{u}(t) P(t)) = \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Then } P(t) (Q(t) + \dot{w}(t))$$

$$= P(t) \left(\frac{1}{u^2} \dot{u}^2 P(t) - \frac{1}{u} \frac{d}{dt} (\dot{u}(t) P(t)) + Q(t) \right)$$

$$= \frac{\dot{u}^2(t) P^2(t)}{u^2(t)} - \frac{P(t)}{u(t)} \left[\frac{d}{dt} (\dot{u}(t) P(t)) - Q(t) u(t) \right]$$

$$= w^2(t) - 0$$

Thus we can write,

$$\int_{t_1}^{t_2} \left(P(t) \dot{h}(t)^2 + Q(t) h(t)^2 \right) dt$$

$$= \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \left(P(t) \dot{h}(t)^2 + 2w(t) h(t) \dot{h}(t) + (Q(t) + w(t)) h(t)^2 \right) dt$$

$$= \int_{t_1}^{t_2} P(t) \left(\dot{h}(t) + \frac{w(t) h(t)}{P(t)} \right)^2 dt$$

$$\geq 0 \quad \forall h(t) \quad h(t_1) = h(t_2) = 0$$

Suppose this expression vanishes for some h .

$$\text{Then} \quad \dot{h}(t) + \frac{w(t) h(t)}{P(t)} \equiv 0 \quad t \in [t_1, t_2]$$

Setting $h(t_1) = 0$ we find that $h(t) = 0$.

(By uniqueness of solutions to ode's)

$$h(t) \equiv 0.$$

\Rightarrow Positive definiteness. 